

EDITED BY LISA FISHBAYN JOFFE AND SYLVIA NEIL

Gender, Religion,
& Family Law
Theorizing Conflicts
between Women's
Rights and Cultural
Traditions

BRANDEIS UNIVERSITY PRESS WALTHAM, MASSACHUSETTS

Brandeis University Press
An imprint of University Press of New England
www.upne.com
© 2013 Brandeis University Press
All rights reserved
Manufactured in the United States of America
Designed by Mindy Basinger Hill

Typeset in 11/14 Garamond Premier Pro by Walton Harris
University Press of New England is a member of the Green Press
Initiative. The paper used in this book meets their minimum
requirement for recycled paper.

For permission to reproduce any of the material in this book,
contact Permissions, University Press of New England, One Court
Street, Suite 250, Lebanon NH 03766; or visit www.upne.com

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Gender, religion, and family law : theorizing conflicts between
women's rights and cultural traditions / edited by Lisa Fishbayn Joffe
and Sylvia Neil.

p. cm. — (Brandeis series on gender, culture, religion, and law)
Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-61168-325-7 (cloth : alk. paper) — ISBN 978-1-61168-
326-4 (pbk. : alk. paper) — ISBN 978-1-61168-327-1 (ebook)

1. Domestic relations. 2. Legal polycentricity. 3. Jews—Legal status,
laws, etc. 4. Muslims—Legal status, laws, etc. 5. Customary law.
6. Domestic relations—South Africa. I. Joffe, Lisa Fishbayn.
II. Neil, Sylvia.

K670. G435 2012
346.01'5—dc23
2012011027

5 4 3 2 1

CONTENTS

- ix Preface
- xiii *Introduction* Theorizing Conflicts between Women's Rights and Religious Laws *Lisa Fishbayn Joffe*
- PART ONE The Ethics of Recognizing Religious Family Law in Secular Societies
- 3 *Chapter One* Principles or Compromises: Accommodating Gender Equality and Religious Freedom in Multicultural Societies *Martha Minow*
- 38 *Chapter Two* Privatizing Diversity: A Cautionary Tale from Religious Arbitration in Family Law *Ayelet Shachar*
- 76 *Chapter Three* Marriage Pluralism, Family Law Jurisdiction, and Sex Equality in the United States *Linda C. McClain*
- PART TWO Exploring the Intersections of Civil and Religious Laws
- 119 *Chapter Four* From Religious "Right" to Civil "Wrong": Using Israeli Tort Law to Unravel the Knots of Gender, Equality, and Jewish Divorce *Susan Weiss*
- 136 *Chapter Five* Flirting with God in Western Secular Courts: *Mahr* in the West *Pascale Fournier*
- 164 *Chapter Six* Muslim Family Law in South Africa: Conflating the Right to Religion with the Privileging of Religion? *Rashida Manjoo*
- 190 *Chapter Seven* Recognition of Polygamous Marriages in the New South Africa *Likhapha Mbatha and Lisa Fishbayn Joffe*

PART THREE Narratives of Innovative Law Reform

- 213 *Chapter Eight* Women, Resources, and Changing
the Religious System: A Case Study of the Orthodox
Jewish Wedding Ritual *Irit Koren*
- 241 *Chapter Nine* The *Yoetzet Halakhah*: Avoiding Conflict While
Instituting Change *Michal Roness*
- 267 *Chapter Ten* The Temple of Women Initiates Project:
A Framework for Culturally Meaningful Feminist Expression
in Rural Areas *Fatou Kiné Camara*
- 293 List of Contributors
- 299 Index